



MINUTES

**CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
MEETING AGENDA**

4:00 p.m., Tuesday, July 22, 2014

Council Chambers – City Hall – 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove, CA

Copies of the agenda packet, and materials related to an item on the agenda submitted after distribution of the agenda packet, are available for review at the Pacific Grove Library located at 550 Central Avenue; the CDD counter in City Hall at 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove from 8 a.m. – 12 p.m. and 1 p.m. – 5 p.m., Monday through Thursday; and on the internet at www.ci.pg.ca.us/pc.

1. Call to Order at 4:00pm

2. Roll Call

Members Present: Jeff Becom, Lydia Collins, Jennifer Groben (Secretary), Jim McCord (Chair), Larry Doocy

Members Absent: Sarah Boyle, Rick Steres

3. Approval of Agenda

On a motion by Member McCord, seconded by Member Collins, the board voted 5-0-2-0 (Steres, Boyle absent) to approve the agenda.

4. Approval of Minutes

a. July 8, 2014

On a motion by Member Becom, seconded by Member Groben, the board voted 5-0-2-0 (Boyle and Steres absent) to approve the July 8, 2014 minutes. Motion passed.

5. Public Comments

a. Written Communications

None.

b. Oral Communications

None.

6. Items to be Continued or Withdrawn

None.

7. Consent Agenda

None.

8. Regular Agenda

a. [Address: 1143 Ripple Ave.](#)

Architectural Permit (AP) Application 14-322

Description: To allow the demolition of 72% of the existing structure and the construction of a two-story, single family residence totally 3,003 square foot.

Applicant/Owner: Chad Brown, Applicant

Zone District: R-1-H

General Plan Designation: Medium Density, 17.4 Du/ac

Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-054-002

CEQA Status: Categorical Exempt, Section 15301(e)

Staff Reference: Ashley Hobson, Contract Assistant Planner

Recommended Action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Chad Brown, designer, spoke on behalf of the project

Mr. Ed Rubona, neighbor, spoke in support of the project.

On a motion by Member Becom, seconded by Member Collins, the board voted 5-0-2-0 (Steres and Boyle absent) to return AP 14-322 to the applicant with the following recommendations:

- Provide details of the proposed permeable materials
- Change window and door details to match renderings
- Clarify the stone color on the plans
- Alter the east elevation to avoid the blank façade

Motion passed and the item will be continued.

b. **Address: 814 Congress Avenue.**

Architectural Permit (AP) Application 14-285

Description: To allow an addition of 1,144 square feet to an existing single story 814 square foot single-family residence for a total of 1,958 square feet and an increase in the building height from 16' to 24'8" creating a two-story single family residence.

Applicant/Owner: Lucas Guettsche/Donald Freeman

Zone District: R-1

General Plan Designation: Medium Density, 17.4 Du/ac

Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-015-005

CEQA Status: Exempt, Class 1, Section 15303(e) (1)

Staff Reference: Laurel O'Halloran, Assistant Planner

Recommended Action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Lucas Guettsche, architect, spoke on behalf of the project.

Lisa Milligan, neighbor on the North side, spoke with concerns for the second story resulting in a loss of privacy for her property.

David, Lisa Milligan's architect, distributed photos and drawings showing the effects of the project to the neighboring properties.

Norma, community member and friend of Lisa Milligan's spoke regarding the impact to the neighboring yards.

On a motion by Member McCord, seconded by Member Becom, the board voted 5-0-2-0 (Boyle and Steres absent) to return AP 14-285 to the applicant to with the following recommendations:

- **Modify solar access to neighboring properties.**

Motion passed and the item will be continued at the next meeting.

c. **Address: 165 Sloat Ave.**

Architectural Permit (AP) Application AP14-372

To approve the proposed stone veneer for the lower level siding of 165 Sloat Avenue. The subject site received ARB approval in April of 2013 and is requesting lower exterior siding changes. The ARB Subcommittee approved changing the 2nd story exterior to horizontal smooth siding and lowering the stone veneer on the front porch elevation to match the surrounding proposed veneer.

Applicant/Owner: Derek Johnson/Michael & Jamie Gerson

Zone District: R-4

General Plan Designation: High Density 29.00 DU/AC

Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-235-012

CEQA Status: Exempt, Class 1, Section 15303(e) (1)

Staff Reference: Laurel O'Halloran, Assistant Planner

Recommended Action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Michael Gerson, owner, spoke on behalf of the project and shared information about the proposed stone. He also shared photos of houses in the surrounding area which have similar stone products.

Inge Lorentzen-Daumer, neighbor, spoke about the project and thanked Staff for updating the minutes from the June 24, 2014 ARB meeting.

Member Collins, member of the subcommittee for this project, spoke regarding her approval of the lower level stone siding.

Member Becom, member of the subcommittee, thanked the applicant for providing a better sample, but still had a concern for the faux stone.

Chair McCord commented on the compatibility of the product (stone) with the rest of the project. He did not think the faux stone was compatible with the design of the house and suggested it was more compatible with a beach house style which this house is not.

Lance, General Contractor, spoke about the faux stone commenting that it was compatible with neighboring houses.

On a motion by Member Becom, seconded by Member Doocy, the board voted 4-1-2-0 (Collins dissent, Boyle and Steres absent) to return AP 14-372 to the applicant with the following recommendations

- **Harmoniously incorporate either natural stone or faux-stone into the structure.**

Motion passed and the item will be continued to the next meeting.

Member Collins spoke regarding her concern with Board getting this specific on materials. She feels the ARB is crossing the line on forcing the ARB's vision on an Applicant's design and vision for their home.

9. New Business

Chair McCord commented that applications should not come before the Architectural Review Board unless they are complete. He would prefer to see the project Data sheet filled out entirely.

Chair McCord commented that it is helpful when a full site plan of neighboring properties is shown and would like this added to the submittal checklist the Planners distribute to Applicants.

10. Reports of ARB Members

None.

11. Reports of Council Liaison

None present.

12. Reports of Staff

None.

13. Adjournment at 5:27pm.

APPROVED BY ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD:

Jennifer Groben, Secretary

Date



MINUTES

**CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
MEETING AGENDA**

4:00 p.m., Tuesday, August 12, 2014

Council Chambers – City Hall – 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove, CA

Copies of the agenda packet, and materials related to an item on the agenda submitted after distribution of the agenda packet, are available for review at the Pacific Grove Library located at 550 Central Avenue; the CDD counter in City Hall at 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove from 8 a.m. – 12 p.m. and 1 p.m. – 5 p.m., Monday through Thursday; and on the internet at www.ci.pg.ca.us/pc.

1. Call to Order at 4:00pm

2. Roll Call

Members Present: Jeff Becom, Jim McCord (Chair), Larry Doocy, Rick Steres

Lydia Collins arrived at 4:48pm

Members Absent: Sarah Boyle, Jennifer Groben (Secretary)

3. Approval of Agenda

No comments.

4. Approval of Minutes

a. July 22, 2014

Continued to the next meeting due to the lack of quorum to approve the item

5. Public Comments

a. Written Communications

None.

b. Oral Communications

Inge commented on the lack of transparency and asked for more attention to database and record keeping.

Chair McCord commented on his agreement with the speaker.

6. Items to be Continued or Withdrawn

None.

7. Consent Agenda

a. **Address: 1143 Ripple Ave.**

Architectural Permit (AP) Application 14-322

Description: To allow the demolition of 72% of the existing structure and the construction of a two-story, single family residence totally 3,003 square foot.

Applicant/Owner: Chad Brown, Applicant

Zone District: R-1-H
General Plan Designation: Medium Density, 17.4 Du/ac
Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-054-002
CEQA Status: Categorical Exempt, Section 15301(e)
Staff Reference: Ashley Hobson, Contract Assistant Planner
Recommended Action: Discuss and take appropriate action

On a motion by Member Becom, seconded by Member Doocy, the board voted 4-0-3-0 (Collins, Groben and Boyle absent) to approve AP 14-322. Motion passed.

8. Regular Agenda

a. [Address: 165 Sloat Ave.](#)

Architectural Permit (AP) Application AP14-372

To approve the proposed stone veneer for the lower level siding of 165 Sloat Avenue. The subject site received ARB approval in April of 2013 and is requesting exterior siding changes. The ARB Subcommittee approved changing the 2nd story exterior to horizontal smooth siding and lowering the stone veneer on the front porch elevation to match the surrounding proposed veneer. The subcommittee majority did not approve the faux stone material

Applicant/Owner: Derek Johnson/Michael & Jamie Gerson

Zone District: R-4

General Plan Designation: High Density 29.00 DU/AC

Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-235-012

CEQA Status: Exempt, Class 1, Section 15303(e) (1)

Staff Reference: Laurel O'Halloran, Assistant Planner

Recommended Action: Discuss and take appropriate action.

Applicant, Michael Gerson, spoke on behalf of the project and explained the El Dorado Stone that was selected for the project. He referred to his letter to the board and presented the proposed stone to the board for reconsideration. He also presented a current photo as well as proposed rendered front elevation drawing to the board.

Staff gave a brief report and recommended final approval for the project.

Peggy Trouder, designer for the project, spoke on her rendering of the proposal and her support for the project.

Inge Lorentzen-Daumer, neighbor, provided photos taken of the house and commented that she does not believe the fake stone fits the house design. She asked the board to limit the "busy-ness" of the house design.

Chair McCord asked the owner to clarify the height of the stone in relation to a submitted photograph of the existing house.

Jami Gerson, owner, spoke of her dream to build a cottage beach house and their preference for their proposed project materials.

Ms. Lorentzen-Daumer commented that member Collins previously stated that it bothered her that the owner's purchased the stone prior to the board's approval.

The building contractor addressed the board that this was his first time working in Pacific Grove and he was under the impression that a change to the siding would be an over the counter approval and the owners should not be penalized for purchasing it.

Jami Gerson, owner, also apologized to the board for purchasing the stone prior to approval.

Member Steres commented that he would like to see the proposed exterior colors. Staff and the applicant clarified the proposed colors.

Member Doocy commented on his concern for their being too many materials on the properties exterior.

Staff clarified that the subcommittee approved the horizontal siding, but not the stone.

Member Steres commented that he does not have a problem with the materials and noted that the applicants pointed out some excellent examples of siding throughout town. He also commented that he would rather see real stone, but that the proposed stone will complement the color well.

Member Becom commented that the stone is too much of a bold statement on a refined house design. The stone may conflict with the quality of the house. He also commented that the stone does not look like a local material and noted the apparent discrepancy of the project with Guideline #38 of the Architectural Review Guidelines.

Chair McCord commented on the mono-chromatic aspects of the home, which may reduce the busy-ness, but noted that there will not be one full-height wall on any of the elevations. He also commented that the stone shown on the plans is not the same as the stone material that was brought to the meeting. Specifically, the stone on the plans is coarser. He expressed that he believes that the proposal is still too busy.

Member Becom commented that the applicant may be at a disadvantage because there are only four members present at the board. He recommended that the proposal be continued to the next meeting.

Lydia Collins entered the meeting at 4:48pm

Chair McCord called a brief recess for Member Collins to catch-up on the conversation.

Discussion was continued.

Jami Gerson, owner, quoted the Architectural Review Guidelines and said “these guidelines are not mandatory requirements. They are intended to allow for individuality, creativity, and variety in architectural design...” She expressed that the board is not allowing enough flexibility and that she does not feel comfortable being told what to do with her design.

Ms. Lorentzen-Daumer commented again that the proposal is simply too busy.

Chair McCord closed the public hearing.

Staff clarified that to approve the project, there will need to be four votes in favor of the motion.

Member Steres proposed to remove the shingles from the upper elevation and substituted the approved horizontal wood siding, but leave the rest of the proposal as it is.

Member Collins commented that she is trying to approach this item from a fresh point of view and that she took a significant amount of time to research the neighborhood. She commented that because the siding on all parts of the house is of similar color, she does not believe that the proposal is too busy. In combination with the style of the stone, the end result of the proposed project will result in a nice beach style.

On a motion by Member Collins, seconded by Member Steres, the board voted 2-3-2-0 (McCord, Becom, and Doocy dissent, Boyle and Groben absent) to approve 14-372. The motion did not pass.

On a motion by Member Steres, seconded by Member Collins, the board voted 4-1-2-0 (Becom dissent, Boyle and Groben absent) to approve 14-372 with a condition that the shingles on the upper floor be changed to wood siding to reduce the busyness of the design. The motion passed.

9. New Business

None.

10. Reports of ARB Members

Member Becom commented that he does not believe staff should give recommendations to the board on agenda items.

Staff will report back to the board regarding City policy on this topic.

11. Reports of Council Liaison

Mayor Kampe thanked the board for their work.

12. Reports of Staff

- a. New Community and Economic Development Director, Mark Brodner, will begin on August 18, 2014.
- b. Meeting on August 27th is cancelled due to a lack of agenda items.

13. Adjournment at 5:14 pm.

APPROVED BY ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD:

Jennifer Groben, Secretary

Date



MINUTES

**CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD
MEETING AGENDA**

4:00 p.m., Tuesday, September 23, 2014

Council Chambers – City Hall – 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove, CA

Copies of the agenda packet, and materials related to an item on the agenda submitted after distribution of the agenda packet, are available for review at the Pacific Grove Library located at 550 Central Avenue; the CDD counter in City Hall at 300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove from 8 a.m. – 12 p.m. and 1 p.m. – 5 p.m., Monday through Thursday; and on the internet at www.ci.pg.ca.us/pc.

1. Call to Order at 4:00pm

2. Roll Call

Members Present: Jeff Becom, Sarah Boyle, Lydia Collins, Larry Doocy, Jennifer Groben (Secretary), Jim McCord (Chair), Rick Steres (Vice Chair)

Members Absent: None

3. Approval of Agenda

On a motion by Member Becom seconded by Member Collins, the board voted 7-0-0 to approve the agenda.

4. Approval of Minutes

Update Lydia entering the meeting in item #3.

Member Groben was absent, Member Steres was there.

a. August 12, 2014

On a motion by Collins, seconded by Member Steres, the members approved the minutes from the August 12, 2014 meeting with modifications 7-0-0.

5. Public Comments

a. Written Communications

None.

b. Oral Communications

None.

6. Items to be Continued or Withdrawn

None.

7. Consent Agenda

None.

8. Regular Agenda

a. **Address: 1095 Lighthouse Ave.**

Architectural Permit (AP) Application AP14-340

Description: Improvements to three existing buildings to change from motel rooms to single-family residences, including adding entries, landings, for the two interior buildings, and a garage and entry for the corner parcel. Also included is the removal of impervious surfaces in the rear yards of the two interior parcels and replacement with turf or another pervious surface.

Applicant/Owner: Henry Ruhnke/Matt Tanzi

Zone District: R-3-M

General Plan Designation: Visitor Accommodation/Medium Density Residential 17.4 DU/AC

Assessor's Parcel Number: 006-361-023

CEQA Status: Exempt

Staff Reference: Anastazia Aziz, AICP, Senior Planner

Recommended Action: Final Approval

Staff gave a brief report on the project.

Henry Ruhnke, applicant, spoke on the project.

Member Steres commented on the lighting and recommended alternative garage lighting and ensure lights are positioned so no direct light extends onto neighboring properties.

Member Becom recommended that the lighting throughout the whole project match the lights proposed for the entryway and that and ARB Subcommittee should see the proposed stone materials before approval.

On a motion by Member Becom, seconded by Member Steres the board voted 7-0-0 to approve the project subject to Subcommittee approval of the garage outdoor lighting and stone veneer material. Motion passed

Member Boyle and Member Steres volunteered to be on the Subcommittee.

9. New Business

None.

10. Reports of ARB Members

Chair McCord commented there is an architectural tour put on by the Monterey Alliance of Historic Preservation on Art Deco homes in Salinas on Saturday, October 25 from 10am-3pm. The tour includes lunch at the Steinbeck House and a guided bus ride.

Chair McCord commented that he has a client who would like to reconstruct the Tea House at Lovers Point and donate it to the City with the intent to lease it back so it can be maintained. Staff commented that there is a Lovers Point Park Draft Master Plan available on the website.

Member Steres commented that the Pacific Grove Home Tour is coming up on

11. Reports of Council Liaison

None present.

12. Director's Report

Staff noted that the City has begun the process to update the Local Coastal Plan with grant money from the California Coastal Commission. Once the Local Coastal Plan is certified by the Coastal Commission and the City, the City will be able to issue Coastal Development Permits. The first community meeting for the plan will be on October 9th at 6pm in the Council Chambers.

Staff invited all members to a webinar on September 30 from 12-1:30 on Energy Efficiency and Historic Preservation put on by the California Preservation Foundation. The webinar is open to all members of the public and will be held in the Council Chambers.

a. Staff recommendations

Director Mark Brodeur introduced himself to the board and commented on his experience with design review. He commented that he will continue to give Staff Recommendations on all items going before the Architectural Review Board.

Chair McCord said that he appreciated Mr. Brodeur's addition to the City, as well as his expertise.

13. Adjournment at 4:41pm.